

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Materials (MS) (GMO ad hoc) Subcommittee Notes **Tuesday, December 12, 2023 1:00 pm ET**

Present: Franklin Quarcoo (FQ), Chair; Wood Turner (WT), Vice Chair; Mindee Jeffery (MJ); Nate Lewis (NL); Brian Caldwell (BC); Dilip Nandwani (DN); Kyla Smith (KS); Amy Bruch - observer

Absent: Logan Petrey (LP)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC); Heather Kumar (HK); Esu Obu (EO)

Agenda

- Review November 14, 2023 notes
- Inert Ingredients in Pesticide Products (FQ, NL, LP, BC)
- Excluded methods- TR templates
- Overview, status, and TR on Tall Oil
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **November 14, 2023** notes were accepted with modifications.
- **Inert Ingredients in Pesticide Products (FQ, NL, LP, BC).** The Food Technologists sent background research to the Chair who shared it with the group. The research for this topic is in the preliminary stages, and the leads intend on writing a discussion document for the Spring 2024 meeting to evaluate the totality of options. The lead(s) will refine the request to HK and EO to narrow the scope and clarify the request. One of the leads asked about hosting an expert panel at the Fall 2024 meeting, which he acknowledged might disrupt the timeline, given that the NOP asked for a recommendation at the Fall 2024 meeting. He suggested panelists representing organic consumers, ingredient suppliers or formulators, and the EPA. The NOSB Chair mentioned that the Board hosted a sanitizer panel outside of the NOSB meeting, and wondered if that would be an option.
- **Excluded methods - TR templates.** The lead summarized the status of the TR template updates for the group. The MS sent a request to the Food Technologists to proofread and review the document, and recently asked to move the deadline earlier, in the interest of finalizing the template for use in the next round of sunset reviews. The templates are a tool that the NOSB uses to complete its work. Additionally, the revised template has been shared with OMRI (the TR contractor) and stakeholders, and feedback from both has been incorporated. -Members had a general conversation about the technical support staff, including integration, workload, and deadlines, and would like to add a standing agenda item at the Executive Committee meeting for updates.
- **Overview, status, and TR on Tall Oil.** The former MS Chair summarized the petition and previous work for tall oil. The review was put on hold until the inerts work was finished, because although tall oil was petitioned as an inert, it was unclear whether it actually was, so the MS felt it was necessary to defer the review until the inerts review was defined.
- **Additional Items.**
 - Induced mutagenesis TR. The MS deemed the TR for induced mutagenesis sufficient in August, and DN revisited the discussion for the benefit of the new Materials' members and Food Technologists. Members discussed the questions in the original TR request, and suggested a revision to question #4 (Can unwanted mutations caused by IM be removed via backcrossing?) to make it more specific. NOP will reach out to OMRI and ask if they can expound. A member asked for a primer on what induced mutagenesis is, given that it is allowed in certain circumstances, and not others, which the lead provided. A member suggested rereading the previous NOSB recommendation to determine what the previous board recommended and why.

- The meeting was adjourned

[Previous MS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (2nd Tuesday 1:00 PM ET | 10:00 AM PT, except where noted)

November 14, 2023

Debrief Fall meeting

Inert Ingredients in Pesticide Products (FQ, NL, LP, BC)

December 12, 2023

Inert Ingredients in Pesticide Products (FQ, NL, LP, BC)

January 9, 2024

Excluded Methods Discussion Doc (MJ/DN/LP) - discuss

Inert Ingredients in Pesticide Products (FQ, NL, LP, BC) - discuss

February 13, 2024

March 12, 2024

April 9, 2024

Work Agenda

*Highlight indicates discussion. *Highlight indicates action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

Projects

Project	National List	Contact	Doc Type	Notes	Scheduled / status	Target meeting
Research Priorities (RPs)	N/A	WT	Discussion Doc	May 2012 Framework Proposal Subcommittee reps to MS: Handling (HS): LP/DN Crops (CS): BC Livestock (LS): BC RPs due to MS from HS, CS, and LS by 01.16.24	2.13.24	Spr 2024
Excluded Methods	N/A	MJ/DN /LP	Discussion Doc	MS requested TR on induced mutagenesis 1.10.23. TR due to NOP end-June. TR sent to MS 7.6.23. TR sufficiency due 9.4.23. TR found sufficient 8.8.23.	12.12.23 1.9.24	Spr 2024

Tall oil, distilled	205.601 205.603	WT	HOLD	2008 Petition (distilled tall oil). 2010 TR (tall oil). Petition sent to MS 9.4.20. Petition suff/TR request due 12.8.20. Petition found sufficient 12.8.20, and the MS requested a TR. TR due mid-Aug. TR sent to MS 8.13.21. TR suff due 10.12.21. TR found sufficient 10.12.21. Additional information from petitioner sent to MS 2.8.22 (see AMS-NOP-21-0087-0003). Returned to Subcomm at Spr 2022 meeting. On hold pending results from ANPR/guidance.	12.12.23	TBD
Inert Ingredients in Pesticide Products	Misc.	FQ, NL, LP, BC	Discussion Doc	June 23, 2023 NOP Memo	9.12.23 10.10.23 11.14.23 12.12.23 1.9.24 2.13.24	Spr 2024

Milestones

Spring 2024 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~Nov 17, 2023	16 -20
NOP - Draft Spring 2024 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 9, 2024	~ 10
NOSB - Spring 2024 proposals due to NOP	Feb 15, 2024	~ 9
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 5, 2024	7.5
Public comment closes	Apr 3, 2024	3.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 5, 2024	3
Public comment webinars	Apr 23 & 25, 2024	1
Spring 2024 NOSB meeting - Milwaukee, WI	Apr 29 - May 1, 2024	0
Final recommendations due	May 29, 2024	30 days post meeting

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Materials (MS) (GMO ad hoc) Subcommittee Notes **Tuesday, November 14, 2023 1:00 pm ET**

Present: Franklin Quarcoo (FQ), Chair; Wood Turner (WT), Vice Chair; Mindee Jeffery (MJ); Nate Lewis (NL); Brian Caldwell (BC); Dilip Nandwani (DN); Kyla Smith (KS)

Absent: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Logan Petrey (LP)

Staff: Jared Clark (JC); Jo Mirenda (JM); Heather Kumar (HK); Esu Obu (EO)

Agenda

- Review October 10, 2023 notes
- Fall 2023 meeting debrief
- Inert Ingredients in Pesticide Products (All) - discuss
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **October 10, 2023** notes were accepted as written.
- **Fall 2023 meeting debrief:** It was a positive meeting. There is lots of momentum around inerts and many great suggestions. The members are grateful for the Food Technologists and their support for upcoming topics/projects. Members discussed scoping a sanitizer work agenda item, and whether Materials has the bandwidth for this work agenda item. A panel discussion at a future Board meeting may help frame the topic. A member expressed interest on working on plastics in organic agriculture.
- **Inert Ingredients in Pesticide Products (All).** The co-leads met in Providence and discussed next steps. They are going to ask the two Food Technologists to compile the information from the Advance Notice of Proposed Rulemaking and comments, specifically an objective analysis of List 4 vs. what is in EPA regulations vs. what is currently in use. Knowing the impact of each option will help guide decision making.
- **TR Templates.** The group has a working draft with some comments from the discussion document about excluded methods. The comments cover nano-particles, excluded methods throughout the production process, and incorporating the NOSB's recommendations on listing specific excluded methods.. Based on the citric acid TR, it is possible that the TRs can include an evaluation of excluded methods in microorganisms, feedstocks, and substrates. The lead will talk with the Food Technologists about the drafts and will return them to the MS with an update.
- **Additional Items.** None.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous MS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (2nd Tuesday 1:00 PM ET | 10:00 AM PT, except where noted)

October 10, 2023

Discuss public comments/Presentation at Fall meeting
Inert Ingredients in Pesticide Products (FQ, NL, LP, BC)

November 14, 2023

Debrief Fall meeting
Inert Ingredients in Pesticide Products (FQ, NL, LP, BC)

December 12, 2023

Inert Ingredients in Pesticide Products (FQ, NL, LP, BC)

January 9, 2024

February 13, 2024
 March 12, 2024
 April 9, 2024

Work Agenda

***Highlight** indicates discussion. ***Highlight** indicates action needed. ***Highlight** indicates review completion and/or vote.

Projects

Project	National List	Contact	Doc Type	Notes	Scheduled / status	Target meeting
Research Priorities (RPs)	N/A	WT	Discussion Doc	May 2012 Framework Proposal Subcommittee reps to MS: Handling (HS): LP/DN Crops (CS): BC Livestock (LS): BC RPs due to MS from HS, CS, and LS by 01.16.24	2.13.24	Spr 2024
Excluded Methods/ TBD List	N/A	MJ/DN /LP	Discussion Doc	MS requested TR on induced mutagenesis 1.10.23. TR due to NOP end-June. TR sent to MS 7.6.23. TR sufficiency due 9.4.23. TR found sufficient 8.8.23.	TBD	Spr 2024
Tall oil, distilled	205.601 205.603	WT	HOLD	2008 Petition (distilled tall oil). 2010 TR (tall oil). Petition sent to MS 9.4.20. Petition suff/TR request due 12.8.20. Petition found sufficient 12.8.20, and the MS requested a TR. TR due mid-Aug. TR sent to MS 8.13.21. TR suff due 10.12.21. TR found sufficient 10.12.21. Additional information from petitioner sent to MS 2.8.22 (see "AMS-NOP-21-0087-0003). Returned to Subcomm at Spr 2022 meeting. On hold pending results from ANPR/guidance.	TBD	TBD
Inert Ingredients in Pesticide Products	Misc.	FQ, NL, LP, BC	Discussion Doc	June 23, 2023 NOP Memo	9.12.23 10.10.23 11.14.23 12.12.23	Spr 2024

Milestones

Spring 2024 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~Nov 17, 2023	16 -20
NOP - Draft Spring 2024 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 9, 2024	~ 10
NOSB - Spring 2024 proposals due to NOP	Feb 15, 2024	~ 9
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 5, 2024	7.5
Public comment closes	Apr 3, 2024	3.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 5, 2024	3
Public comment webinars	Apr 23 & 25, 2024	1
Spring 2024 NOSB meeting - Milwaukee, WI	Apr 29 - May 1, 2024	0
Final recommendations due	May 29, 2024	30 days post meeting

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Materials (MS) (GMO ad hoc) Subcommittee Notes **Tuesday, October 10, 2023 1:00 pm ET**

Present: Logan Petrey (LP), Vice Chair; Franklin Quarcoo (FQ); Mindee Jeffery (MJ); Nate Lewis (NL); Brian Caldwell (BC); Dilip Nandwani (DN)

Absent: Jared Clark (JC); Wood Turner (WT), Chair; Carolyn Dimitri (CD)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Heather Kumar (HK); Esu Obu (EO)

Agenda

- Review September 12, 2023 notes
- Discuss public comments/Presentations at Fall meeting
- Inert Ingredients in Pesticide Products (All) - discuss
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **September 12, 2023** notes were accepted with modifications.
- **Discuss public comments/Presentations at Fall meeting (All).** The group had a brief discussion of the comments.

Inert Ingredients in Pesticide Products (All). The leads have engaged in discussions with NOP for ideas on how to move forward, including the four options proposed in the Advance Notice of Proposed Rulemaking (ANPR). The MS discussed difficulties and challenges associated with this project, and one member suggested that it might not be as difficult as initially thought because, while there are a lot of inerts, most are not in use. A member added that given the complexity, it's important to send a clear message and be as transparent as possible.

The group introduced several ideas such as utilizing EPA lists of allowed tolerances, or assessing inerts used in post-harvest handling. For now, they are keeping all ideas on the table, and will continue to discuss the options. The MS Chair will seek feedback during the October 16 Executive Committee call about whether to present an update on Inerts at the Fall NOSB meeting. If they decide to present an update, they will do it either during the work agenda update or under "other business" on the last day. The co-leads may also schedule some time at the Fall NOSB meeting to discuss this further.

- **Additional Items.**
 - TR templates update. The MS has until ~ May 2024 to get the updates completed, in time for the next round of sunset requests. The group discussed the potential implications of TR updates, and may reach out to TR writers and the Accredited Certifiers Association (ACA) who may ultimately be the end users.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous MS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (2nd Tuesday 1:00 PM ET | 10:00 AM PT, except where noted)

September 12, 2023

October 10, 2023

Discuss public comments/Presentation at Fall meeting

Inert Ingredients in Pesticide Products (FQ, NL, LP, BC)

November 14, 2023

Inert Ingredients in Pesticide Products (FQ, NL, LP, BC)

December 12, 2023

Inert Ingredients in Pesticide Products (FQ, NL, LP, BC)

Work Agenda

***Highlight** indicates discussion. ***Highlight** indicates action needed. ***Highlight** indicates review completion and/or vote.

Projects

Project	National List	Contact	Doc Type	Notes	Scheduled / status	Target meeting
Research Priorities (RPs)	N/A	WT	Proposal (Fall 2023)	May 2012 Framework Proposal Subcommittee reps to MS: Handling (HS): WT Crops (CS): BC Livestock (LS): BC RPs due to MS from HS, CS, and LS by ~7.20.23	5.9.23 6.27.23 7.11.23 8.8.23	Fall 2023
Excluded Methods/TBD List	N/A	MJ/DN /LP	TBD	MS requested TR on induced mutagenesis 1.10.23. TR due to NOP end-June. TR sent to MS 7.6.23. TR sufficiency due 9.4.23. TR found sufficient 8.8.23.	5.9.23 6.27.23 7.11.23 8.8.23 9.12.23	Spr 2024
Tall oil, distilled	205.601 205.603	WT	HOLD	2008 Petition (distilled tall oil). 2010 TR (tall oil). Petition sent to MS 9.4.20. Petition suff/TR request due 12.8.20. Petition found sufficient 12.8.20, and the MS requested a TR. TR due mid-Aug. TR sent to MS 8.13.21. TR suff due 10.12.21. TR found sufficient 10.12.21. Additional information from petitioner sent to MS 2.8.22 (see "AMS-NOP-21-0087-0003"). Returned to Subcomm at Spr 2022 meeting. On hold pending results from ANPR/guidance.	TBD	TBD
Inert Ingredients in Pesticide Products	Misc.	FQ, NL, LP, BC	Discussion Doc	June 23, 2023 NOP Memo	9.12.23 10.10.23 11.14.23 12.12.23	Spr 2024

Milestones

Fall 2023 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Jun 8, 2023

NOP - Draft Fall 2022 NOSB meeting agenda	Aug 4, 2023
NOSB - Fall 2023 proposals due to NOP	Aug 10, 2023
NOP - Post proposals	Aug 30, 2023
Public comment closes	Sep 28, 2023
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 2, 2023
Public comment webinars	Oct 17 & 19, 2023
Fall 2023 NOSB meeting - Providence, RI	Oct 24 - 26, 2023
Final recommendations due	Nov 25, 2023

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Materials (MS) (GMO ad hoc) Subcommittee Notes **Tuesday, September 12, 2023 1:00 pm ET**

Present: Wood Turner (WT), Chair; Logan Petrey (LP), Vice Chair; Franklin Quarcoo (FQ); Mindee Jeffery (MJ); Nate Lewis (NL); Carolyn Dimitri (CD); Brian Caldwell (BC)

Absent: Dilip Nandwani (DN)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC); Heather Kumar (HK)

Agenda

- Review August 8, 2023 notes
- Inerts work agenda - workflow planning discussion (All)
- Excluded Methods (MJ) - vote/align on TR template
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **August 8, 2023** notes were accepted as written.
- **Inerts - work agenda , workflow planning discussion (All).** The group discussed preliminary planning and workflow for the Inert Ingredients in Pesticide Products work agenda item. Four members will collaborate, and were chosen based on interest and expertise. NOP will assist and other members are welcome to contribute. The group discussed the challenges, which may be sizable. A member suggested the following next steps: 1. Understand the four options; 2. Analyze public comments; 3. Compare Inerts to other lists (nutrient vitamins/minerals etc.); 4 Develop discussion document for the Spring 2024 meeting; 5. Develop proposal for Fall 2024 meeting. The MS discussed the proposal deadline for the Spring meeting, which is February 15, 2024, and how that affects the workplan. The MS posted a preliminary discussion document in the open comment docket for the Fall 2023 meeting, and is currently gathering stakeholder feedback. The comment period closes September 28, and the MS will review public comments on the October 10 call. The MS may have something to communicate to the Board and community at the Fall 2023 NOSB meeting.
- **TR template, excluded methods (MJ) - vote/align.** The lead summarized the work to date. Public comment was incorporated into the updated draft templates and the group discussed some lingering questions, such as fermentation, and how far back in the process should they look. The lead left comments for members' consideration.
The group had an in-depth conversation about the goals, the current process for reviewing substances, and the classification of materials decision trees
(https://www.ams.usda.gov/sites/default/files/media/Program%20Handbk_TOC.pdf: NOP 5033, 5033-1, 5033-2, and 5033-3), which are publicly available. The ultimate goal will determine how far back in the process to look. Members discussed the best way forward. A member suggested waiting for the TR for vitamins, which may help to answer some of the questions. Members expressed support for this project, given the fast-paced changes in the biotech industry.
- **Additional Items.** None.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous MS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (2nd Tuesday 1:00 PM ET | 10:00 AM PT, except where noted)

August 8, 2023

Research Priorities (All) - discuss/vote

September 12, 2023

October 10, 2023

Discuss public comments/Presentation at Fall meeting

Inert Ingredients in Pesticide Products

November 14, 2023

December 12, 2023

Work Agenda

*Highlight indicates discussion. *Highlight indicates action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

Projects

Project	National List	Contact	Doc Type	Notes	Scheduled / status	Target meeting
Research Priorities (RPs)	N/A	WT	Proposal (Fall 2023)	May 2012 Framework Proposal Subcommittee reps to MS: Handling (HS): WT Crops (CS): BC Livestock (LS): BC RPs due to MS from HS, CS, and LS by ~7.20.23	5.9.23 6.27.23 7.11.23 8.8.23	Fall 2023
Excluded Methods/TBD List	N/A	MJ/DN /LP	TBD	MS requested TR on induced mutagenesis 1.10.23. TR due to NOP end-June. TR sent to MS 7.6.23. TR sufficiency due 9.4.23. TR found sufficient 8.8.23.	5.9.23 6.27.23 7.11.23 8.8.23 9.12.23	Spr 2024
Tall oil, distilled	205.601 205.603	WT	HOLD	2008 Petition (distilled tall oil). 2010 TR (tall oil). Petition sent to MS 9.4.20. Petition suff/TR request due 12.8.20. Petition found sufficient 12.8.20, and the MS requested a TR. TR due mid-Aug. TR sent to MS 8.13.21. TR suff due 10.12.21. TR found sufficient 10.12.21. Additional information from petitioner sent to MS 2.8.22 (see "AMS-NOP-21-0087-0003). Returned to Subcomm at Spr 2022 meeting. On hold pending results from ANPR/guidance.	TBD	TBD
Inert Ingredients in Pesticide Products	Misc.	FQ, NL, LP, BC	Discussion Doc	June 23, 2023 NOP Memo	9.12.23 10.10.23 11.14.23 12.12.23	Spr 2024

Milestones

Fall 2023 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Jun 8, 2023
NOP - Draft Fall 2022 NOSB meeting agenda	Aug 4, 2023
NOSB - Fall 2023 proposals due to NOP	Aug 10, 2023
NOP - Post proposals	Aug 30, 2023
Public comment closes	Sep 28, 2023
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 2, 2023
Public comment webinars	Oct 17 & 19, 2023
Fall 2023 NOSB meeting - Providence, RI	Oct 24 - 26, 2023
Final recommendations due	Nov 25, 2023

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Materials (MS) (GMO ad hoc) Subcommittee Notes **Tuesday, August 8, 2023 1:00 pm ET**

Present: Wood Turner (WT), Chair; Logan Petrey (LP), Vice Chair; Franklin Quarcoo (FQ); Brian Caldwell (BC); Mindee Jeffery (MJ); Dilip Nandwani (DN); Nate Powell-Palm (NPP) - observer

Absent: Carolyn Dimitri (CD)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC)

Agenda

- Review July 11, 2023 notes
- Research Priorities (RPs) (All)
- Excluded Methods/TBD List (DN, MJ, NL) - TR sufficiency
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **July 11, 2023** notes were accepted as written.
- **Research Priorities (RPs) (All).** The MS discussed the current iteration of the Research Priorities proposal, which includes updates from the Livestock and Crops Subcommittees. The Chair asked for feedback and members expressed support for the additions. Several Subcommittee members suggested an additional research priority to address equity and barriers in minority communities with regard to access to organic food. The group added language under the general section/Increasing access to Organic Food. The MS moved to a vote on the proposal. The Chair also reminded members that no matter how they vote in Subcommittee, they can change their vote when it comes before the full Board.

Motion to accept the proposal on the 2023 NOSB Research Priorities

Motion by: WT

Seconded by: DN

Yes: 6 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 1

- **Excluded Methods/TBD List (DN, MJ, NL).** The TR was found sufficient and comprehensive.
Post-call note: Due to lack of time, one member was unable to convey that he had an additional request for the TR writers; to expand on one of the answers. The MS maintains that the TR is sufficient, and NOP will forward the additional question.
- **Additional Items.** None
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous MS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (2nd Tuesday 1:00 PM ET | 10:00 AM PT, except where noted)

July 11, 2023

Research Priorities (All)

Excluded Methods/TBD List

August 8, 2023

Research Priorities (All) - discuss/vote

September 12, 2023

October 10, 2023

November 14, 2023

December 12, 2023

Work Agenda

*Highlight indicates discussion. *Highlight indicates action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

Projects

Project	National List	Contact	Doc Type	Notes	Scheduled / status	Target meeting
Research Priorities (RPs)	N/A	WT	Proposal (Fall 2023)	May 2012 Framework Proposal Subcommittee reps to MS: Handling (HS): WT Crops (CS): BC Livestock (LS): BC RPs due to MS from HS, CS, and LS by ~7.20.23	5.9.23 6.27.23 7.11.23 8.8.23	Fall 2023
Excluded Methods/TBD List	N/A	MJ/DN /LP	TBD	MS requested TR on induced mutagenesis 1.10.23. TR due to NOP end-June. TR sent to MS 7.6.23. TR sufficiency due 9.4.23. TR found sufficient 8.8.23.	5.9.23 6.27.23 7.11.23 8.8.23	Spr 2024
Tall oil, distilled	205.601 205.603	WT	HOLD	2008 Petition (distilled tall oil). 2010 TR (tall oil). Petition sent to MS 9.4.20. Petition suff/TR request due 12.8.20. Petition found sufficient 12.8.20, and the MS requested a TR. TR due mid-Aug. TR sent to MS 8.13.21. TR suff due 10.12.21. TR found sufficient 10.12.21. Additional information from petitioner sent to MS 2.8.22 (see "AMS-NOP-21-0087-0003"). Returned to Subcomm at Spr 2022 meeting. On hold pending results from ANPR/guidance.	TBD	TBD
Inert Ingredients in Pesticide Products	Misc.	TBD	Discussion Doc	June 23, 2023 NOP Memo		Spr 2024

Milestones

Fall 2023 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Jun 8, 2023
NOP - Draft Fall 2022 NOSB meeting agenda	Aug 4, 2023

NOSB - Fall 2023 proposals due to NOP	Aug 10, 2023
NOP - Post proposals	Aug 30, 2023
Public comment closes	Sep 28, 2023
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 2, 2023
Public comment webinars	Oct 17 & 19, 2023
Fall 2023 NOSB meeting - Providence, RI	Oct 24 - 26, 2023
Final recommendations due	Nov 25, 2023

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Materials (MS) (GMO ad hoc) Subcommittee Notes **Tuesday, July 11, 2023 1:00 pm ET**

Present: Wood Turner (WT), Chair; Logan Petrey (LP), Vice Chair; Carolyn Dimitri (CD); Dilip Nandwani (DN); Franklin Quarcoo (FQ); Brian Caldwell (BC)

Absent: Mindee Jeffery (MJ)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC)

Agenda

- Review June 27, 2023 notes
- Research Priorities (RPs) (All)
- Excluded Methods/TBD List (MJ, NL)
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **June 27, 2023** notes were accepted as amended.
- **Research Priorities (RPs) (All).** The group reviewed the draft research priorities document and discussed the item that was broached on the last call regarding the lack of state-matched funds for the 1890's institutions. The MS determined that this topic might be better addressed via a research priority. A member suggested that this might be a topic to add to the CACS document on equity. The MS Chair will approach AJ who is the lead author on the equity document. Members discussed additional questions for the MS research priorities - one specific to the Materials Subcommittee and one general question. The MS Chair asked for feedback by July 20 so it can be incorporated into the document in time to vote on the August 8 call.
The group suggested potential tasks for the new technical support staff such as conducting literature reviews on some of the RP questions, which could be valuable to the community and will help the NOSB assess progress on its current priorities. Currently the feedback loop is lacking, and it's hard to know what priorities are being researched. The search for two new staff is underway.
The group also discussed the dissemination of data to end-users/farmers and how and where that information should be housed. For example, e-organic, a grant-based program, was supposed to be a place to house such research, but it's uncertain whether it is effective. A member used an example of a farmer who wanted to transition to organic because they had some unused land, but didn't have the relevant information about why it was not a viable option.
- **Excluded Methods/TBD List.** The TR for induced mutagenesis was sent to the MS on July 6. DN will complete the TR sufficiency for the August 8 call. The TR templates were revised to include questions on excluded methods, and will be used for future reviews. Currently the documents are not ready to send to the TR writers, as they are still undergoing final edits. The lead is awaiting feedback from other members. Since they are not finalized, the Subcommittees incorporated some specific questions into requests for 2026 limited scope TRs.
- **Additional Items.** None.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous MS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (2nd Tuesday 1:00 PM ET | 10:00 AM PT, except where noted)

June 27, 2023

July 11, 2023

Research Priorities (All)
Excluded Methods/TBD List

August 8, 2023

Research Priorities (All) - discuss/vote

Excluded Methods/Induced mutagenesis -TR sufficiency (due 9.4.23)/vote

September 12, 2023

October 10, 2023

November 14, 2023

December 12, 2023

Work Agenda

***Highlight** indicates discussion. ***Highlight** indicates action needed. ***Highlight** indicates review completion and/or vote.

Projects

Project	National List	Contact	Doc Type	Notes	Scheduled / status	Target meeting
Research Priorities (RPs)	N/A	WT	Proposal (Fall 2023)	May 2012 Framework Proposal Subcommittee reps to MS: Handling (HS): WT Crops (CS): BC Livestock (LS): BC RPs due to MS from HS, CS, and LS by ~7.20.23	5.9.23 6.27.23 7.11.23 8.8.23	Fall 2023
Excluded Methods/TBD List	N/A	MJ/DN /LP	Proposal	MS requested TR on induced mutagenesis 1.10.23. TR due to NOP end-June. TR sent to MS 7.6.23. TR sufficiency due 9.4.23	5.9.23 6.27.23 7.11.23 8.8.23	Fall 2023
Tall oil, distilled	205.601 205.603	WT	HOLD	2008 Petition (distilled tall oil). 2010 TR (tall oil). Petition sent to MS 9.4.20. Petition suff/TR request due 12.8.20. Petition found sufficient 12.8.20, and the MS requested a TR. TR due mid-Aug. TR sent to MS 8.13.21. TR suff due 10.12.21. TR found sufficient 10.12.21. Additional information from petitioner sent to MS 2.8.22 (see "AMS-NOP-21-0087-0003"). Returned to Subcomm at Spr 2022 meeting. On hold pending results from ANPR/guidance.	TBD	TBD

Milestones

Fall 2023 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Jun 8, 2023
NOP - Draft Fall 2022 NOSB meeting agenda	Aug 4, 2023
NOSB - Fall 2023 proposals due to NOP	Aug 10, 2023
NOP - Post proposals	Aug 30, 2023
Public comment closes	Sep 28, 2023
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 2, 2023
Public comment webinars	Oct 17 & 19, 2023
Fall 2023 NOSB meeting - Providence, RI	Oct 24 - 26, 2023
Final recommendations due	Nov 25, 2023

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Materials (MS) (GMO ad hoc) Subcommittee Notes

Tuesday, June 27, 2023 1:00 pm ET

Present: Wood Turner (WT), Chair; Carolyn Dimitri (CD); Mindee Jeffery (MJ); Franklin Quarcoo (FQ); Brian Caldwell (BC); Nate Lewis (NL) - observer

Absent: Dilip Nandwani (DN); Logan Petrey (LP), Vice Chair

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC)

Agenda

- Review May 9, 2023 notes
- Research Priorities (RPs) (All)
- Excluded Methods/TBD List (MJ, NL)
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **May 9, 2023** notes were accepted as written
- **Research Priorities (RPs).** Materials has received Handling's RPs and is awaiting LS and CS. The Chair pointed out the 5 materials-related priorities and invited feedback and discussion. A member asked about the possibility of adding a work agenda item focused on a finding from the equity commission related to state matching funds for the 1890 institutions, and will work on compiling some background information with another Subcommittee member. The MS Chair will circulate the current draft document and asked that members review the five priorities for discussion on the next call.
- **Excluded Methods/To-Be-Determined (TBD) List (MJ, NL).** The TR for induced mutagenesis is due back soon and once the NOP completes its review, it will be sent to the MS. The lead suggested they wait for the TR to complete that part of the TBD list. A member reminded the group that commenters responded to the Subcommittees questions at the Spring meeting, but also suggested other changes, and he would like to talk more about how these changes could be implemented. A member noted an overlap with the Handling Subcommittee with substances made using fermentation. The group discussed the path forward, acknowledging that this is a long-term project. The Chair expressed appreciation to the members for looking at the issues with a macro-lens, and focusing on long term solutions.
- **Additional Items.**
 - TR template update (NL, MJ). The TR templates were recently revised to include terminology and questions about excluded methods. The co-lead discussed how excluded methods are currently verified by ACAs, noting the resources they use, which include Organic Systems Plans (OSPs) and TRs. As an example, Handling requested a TR for citric acid and included questions about which streams of microorganisms (used in the production of citric acid) are manufactured with excluded methods. Using the TR as a means to get this information does not require regulatory change, and could be nimble and transparent, and ACAs already use TRs as a resource. Members discussed the differences in the scopes (i.e., Crops and Livestock vs Handling), substrates vs feedstocks, fermentation products, and how far back in the process the review should start. The MS will move incrementally and modify and revise the template as needed. The updated TR template presented at the Spring 2023 meeting is the version they will use to start.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous MS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (2nd Tuesday 1:00 PM ET | 10:00 AM PT, except where noted)

May 9, 2023

June 27, 2023

July 11, 2023

Research Priorities (All)

Excluded Methods/TBD List

August 8, 2023

September 12, 2023

October 10, 2023

November 14, 2023

December 12, 2023

Work Agenda

***Highlight** indicates discussion. ***Highlight** indicates action needed. ***Highlight** indicates review completion and/or vote.

Projects

Project	National List	Contact	Doc Type	Notes	Scheduled / status	Target meeting
Research Priorities (RPs)	N/A	WT	Proposal (Fall 2023)	May 2012 Framework Proposal <u>Subcommittee reps to MS:</u> Handling (HS): WT Crops (CS): BC Livestock (LS): BC RPs due to MS from HS, CS, and LS by ~7.20.23	5.9.23 6.27.23 7.11.23	Fall 2023
Excluded Methods/TBD List	N/A	MJ/DN /LP	Proposal	MS requested TR on induced mutagenesis 1.10.23. TR due to NOP end-June	5.9.23 6.27.23 7.11.23	Fall 2023
Tall oil, distilled	205.601 205.603	WT	HOLD	2008 Petition (distilled tall oil). 2010 TR (tall oil). Petition sent to MS 9.4.20. Petition suff/TR request due 12.8.20. Petition found sufficient 12.8.20, and the MS requested a TR. TR due mid-Aug. TR sent to MS 8.13.21. TR suff due 10.12.21. TR found sufficient 10.12.21. Additional information from petitioner sent to MS 2.8.22 (see "AMS-NOP-21-0087-0003"). Returned to Subcomm at Spr 2022 meeting. On hold pending results from ANPR/guidance.	TBD	TBD

Milestones

Fall 2023 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Jun 8, 2023
NOP - Draft Fall 2022 NOSB meeting agenda	Aug 4, 2023
NOSB - Fall 2023 proposals due to NOP	Aug 10, 2023
NOP - Post proposals	Aug 30, 2023
Public comment closes	Sep 28, 2023
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 2, 2023
Public comment webinars	Oct 17 & 19, 2023
Fall 2023 NOSB meeting - Providence, RI	Oct 24 - 26, 2023
Final recommendations due	Nov 25, 2023

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Materials (MS) (GMO ad hoc) Subcommittee Notes **Tuesday, May 9, 2023 1:00 pm ET**

Present: Wood Turner (WT), Chair; Dilip Nandwani (DN); Carolyn Dimitri (CD); Mindee Jeffery (MJ); Franklin Quarcoo (FQ)

Absent: Brian Caldwell (BC); Logan Petrey (LP), Vice Chair

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC)

Agenda

- Review April 5, 2023 notes
- Debrief from April 2023 NOSB meeting
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **April 5, 2023 notes** were accepted with modifications to the RP conversation.
- **Debrief from April 2023 NOSB meeting.**
 - The NOSB Vice Chair opened the floor for feedback about the meeting.
 - TR template update. The next steps will be to incorporate suggestions regarding excluded methods. Given the helpful comments and support from the community, the MS will update the document and will not produce a version for the Fall meeting, and therefore the entry in the work agenda table below was deleted. Members also discussed the path forward for the work agenda item on Excluded Methods in general. The lead will send collated comments to other members to begin the conversation about the next iteration to draw a clear picture for the community.
 - Members discussed previous recommendations and outcomes for organic seed and will ask a follow up question to the NOP during the Executive Committee call next week.
 - Research Priorities. The lead reviewed his notes from the Spring meeting, and will share them with members. A member suggested outreach efforts prior to the Fall meeting so the list is seen by researchers and other funding agencies sooner.
- **Additional Items.** None.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous MS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (2nd Tuesday 1:00 PM ET | 10:00 AM PT, except where noted)

April 5, 2023 (Wednesday)

May 9, 2023

June 13, 2023

July 11, 2023

August 8, 2023

September 12, 2023

October 10, 2023

November 14, 2023

December 12, 2023

Work Agenda

***Highlight** indicates discussion. ***Highlight** indicates action needed. ***Highlight** indicates review completion and/or vote.

Projects

Project	National List	Contact	Doc Type	Notes	Scheduled / status	Target meeting
Research Priorities (RPs)	N/A	WT	Proposal (Fall 2023)	May 2012 Framework Proposal <u>Subcommittee reps to MS:</u> Handling (HS): WT Crops (CS): BC Livestock (LS): BC RPs due to MS from HS, CS, and LS by ~7.20.23	5.9.23	Fall 2023
Excluded Methods/TBD List	N/A	MJ/DN /LP	Proposal	MS requested TR on induced mutagenesis 1.10.23. TR due to NOP end-June	5.9.23	Fall 2023
Tall oil, distilled	205.601 205.603	WT	HOLD	2008 Petition (distilled tall oil). 2010 TR (tall oil). Petition sent to MS 9.4.20. Petition suff/TR request due 12.8.20. Petition found sufficient 12.8.20, and the MS requested a TR. TR due mid-Aug. TR sent to MS 8.13.21. TR suff due 10.12.21. TR found sufficient 10.12.21. Additional information from petitioner sent to MS 2.8.22 (see "AMS-NOP-21-0087-0003"). Returned to Subcomm at Spr 2022 meeting. On hold pending results from ANPR/guidance.	TBD	TBD

Milestones

Fall 2023 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~May 20, 2023
NOP - Draft Fall 2022 NOSB meeting agenda	Aug 4, 2023
NOSB - Fall 2023 proposals due to NOP	Aug 10, 2023
NOP - Post proposals	Aug 30, 2023
Public comment closes	Sep 28, 2023
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 2, 2023

Public comment webinars	Oct 17 & 19, 2023
Fall 2023 NOSB meeting - Providence, RI	Oct 24 - 26, 2023
Final recommendations due	Nov 25, 2023

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Materials (MS) (GMO ad hoc) Subcommittee Notes **Wednesday, April 5, 2023 2:00 pm ET**

Present: Wood Turner (WT), Chair; Brian Caldwell (BC); Dilip Nandwani (DN); Carolyn Dimitri (CD); Franklin Quarcoo (FQ)

Absent: Logan Petrey (LP), Vice Chair; Mindee Jeffery (MJ)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA)

Agenda

- Review February 14, 2023 notes
- Discuss presentations for April 2023 meeting
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **February 14, 2023 notes** were accepted as written.
- **Discuss presentations for April 2023 meeting**
 - Excluded Methods/TBD List - MJ will present at Spring 2023 NOSB meeting.
 - Research Priorities - WT will present high level overview and summary.
 - Petition and Technical Report (TR) tracking: Update to TR template - MJ will present at Spring 2023 NOSB meeting.
- **Additional Items.** None.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous MS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (2nd Tuesday 1:00 PM ET | 10:00 AM PT, except where noted)

Feb 14, 2023

Research Priorities (WT/All)

TR template updates (BC/MJ)

Excluded Methods (MJ/DN/LP)

Mar 15, 2023 (Wednesday) - no quorum

April 5, 2023 (Wednesday)

May 9, 2023

June 13, 2023

July 11, 2023

August 8, 2023

September 12, 2023

October 10, 2023

November 14, 2023

December 12, 2023

Work Agenda

***Highlight** indicates discussion. ***Highlight** indicates action needed. ***Highlight** indicates review completion and/or vote.

Projects

Project	National List	Contact	Doc Type	Notes	Scheduled / status	Target meeting
Research Priorities (RPs)	N/A	WT	Discussion Document (Spr 2023) Proposal (Fall 2023)	May 2012 Framework Proposal <u>Subcommittee reps to MS:</u> Handling (HS): WT Crops (CS): BC Livestock (LS): BC RPs due to MS from HS, CS, and LS by 1.20.23	12.13.22 1.10.23 2.14.23	Spr 2023
Petition and Technical Report (TR) tracking: Update to TR template	N/A	BC/MJ /NOP	NA	Ongoing	11.08.22 12.13.22 1.10.23 2.14.23	N/A
Excluded Methods/TBD List	N/A	MJ/DN /LP	Proposal	MS requested TR on induced mutagenesis 1.10.23.	11.08.22 12.13.22 1.10.23 2.14.23	Spr 2023
Tall oil, distilled	205.601 205.603	WT	HOLD	2008 Petition (distilled tall oil). 2010 TR (tall oil). Petition sent to MS 9.4.20. Petition suff/TR request due 12.8.20. Petition found sufficient 12.8.20, and the MS requested a TR. TR due mid-Aug. TR sent to MS 8.13.21. TR suff due 10.12.21. TR found sufficient 10.12.21. Additional information from petitioner sent to MS 2.8.22 (see "AMS-NOP-21-0087-0003"). Returned to Subcomm at Spr 2022 meeting. On hold pending results from ANPR/guidance.	TBD	TBD

Milestones

Spring 2023 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Feb 14, 2023	10 weeks
NOSB - Spring 2023 proposals due to NOP	Feb 14, 2023	10 weeks
New NOSB member training	TBD	
NOP - Draft Spring 2023 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 3, 2023	

NOP - Post proposals	Mar 6, 2023	7.5
Public comment closes	Apr 5, 2023	3.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 7, 2023	3
Public comment webinars	Apr 18 & 20, 2023	1 week
Spring 2023 NOSB meeting - Atlanta, GA	Apr 25 - 27, 2023	
Final recommendations due	May 25, 2023	

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Materials (MS) (GMO ad hoc) Subcommittee Notes
Tuesday, February 14, 2023 1:00 pm ET

Present: Wood Turner (WT), Chair; Brian Caldwell (BC); Mindee Jeffery (MJ); Dilip Nandwani (DN); Carolyn Dimitri (CD)

Absent: Logan Petrey (LP), Vice Chair

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC)

Agenda

- Review January 10, 2023 notes
- Research Priorities (WT/All)
- TR template updates (BC/MJ)
- Excluded Methods (MJ/DN/LP)
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **January 10, 2023 notes** were accepted with minor edits.
- **Research Priorities (WT/All).** The lead introduced the discussion document, and the group discussed the original intent of the Research Priorities framework. The lead will finalize the document and submit it for the Spring meeting.

Motion to accept the research priorities discussion document

Motion by: WT

Seconded by: CD

Yes: 5 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 1

- **TR template updates discussion document (BC/MJ).** The lead presented the draft discussion document, and the group suggested minor edits. The lead will incorporate the changes and submit the document for posting to the Spring meeting docket.

Motion to accept the discussion document on TR template updates

Motion by: MJ

Seconded by: DN

Yes: 5 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 1

- **Excluded Methods TBD list discussion document (MJ/DN/LP).** The group discussed the excluded methods discussion document and the specific feedback they are seeking from stakeholders at the Spring meeting. The goal of this document is to collect feedback about the proposed definitions and techniques. The abbreviated document will be posted for public comment.

Motion to accept the discussion document on the excluded methods TBD List

Motion by: MJ

Seconded by: BC

Yes: 5 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 1

- **Additional Items.**
 - During the next call the MS will determine who will present the documents at the Spring meeting.
 - The NOP proposed the idea of rescheduling the Research Priorities to have a discussion document in the Fall, and a proposal in the Spring, which might sync better with NIFA's (National Institute of Food and Agriculture) request for proposals (RFPs) publishing date. Members chose to leave the schedule as is as they believe it works well.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous MS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (2nd Tuesday 1:00 PM ET | 10:00 AM PT, except where noted)

Jan 10, 2023

Research Priorities (WT/All)
 TR template updates (BC/MJ)
 Excluded Methods (MJ/DN/LP)

Feb 14, 2023

Research Priorities (WT/All)
 TR template updates (BC/MJ)
 Excluded Methods (MJ/DN/LP)

Mar 14, 2023

April 11, 2023

May 9, 2023

June 13, 2023

July 11, 2023

August 8, 2023

September 12, 2023

October 10, 2023

November 14, 2023

December 12, 2023

Work Agenda

***Highlight** indicates discussion. ***Highlight** indicates action needed. ***Highlight** indicates review completion and/or vote.

Projects

Project	National List	Contact	Doc Type	Notes	Scheduled / status	Target meeting
Research Priorities (RP)	N/A	WT	Discussion Document (Spr 2023) Proposal (Fall 2023)	May 2012 Framework Proposal Subcommittee reps to MS: Handling (HS): WT Crops (CS): BC Livestock (LS): BC RPs due to MS from HS, CS, and LS by 1.20.23	12.13.22 1.10.23 2.14.23	Spr 2023
Petition and Technical Report (TR) tracking: Update to TR template	N/A	BC/MJ /NOP	Discussion doc	Ongoing	11.08.22 12.13.22 1.10.23 2.14.23	N/A

Excluded Methods	N/A	MJ/DN /LP	Proposal	MS requested TR on induced mutagenesis 1.10.23.	11.08.22 12.13.22 1.10.23 2.14.23	Spr 2023
Tall oil, distilled	205.601 205.603	WT	HOLD	2008 Petition (distilled tall oil). 2010 TR (tall oil). Petition sent to MS 9.4.20. Petition suff/TR request due 12.8.20. Petition found sufficient 12.8.20, and the MS requested a TR. TR due mid-Aug. TR sent to MS 8.13.21. TR suff due 10.12.21. TR found sufficient 10.12.21. Additional information from petitioner sent to MS 2.8.22 (see "AMS-NOP-21-0087-0003"). Returned to Subcomm at Spr 2022 meeting. On hold pending results from ANPR/guidance.	TBD	TBD

Milestones

Spring 2023 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	Feb 14, 2023	10 weeks
NOSB - Spring 2023 proposals due to NOP	Feb 14, 2023	10 weeks
New NOSB member training	TBD	
NOP - Draft Spring 2023 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 3, 2023	
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 6, 2023	7.5
Public comment closes	Apr 5, 2023	3.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 7, 2023	3
Public comment webinars	Apr 18 & 20, 2023	1 week
Spring 2023 NOSB meeting - Atlanta, GA	Apr 25 - 27, 2023	
Final recommendations due	May 25, 2023	

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Materials (MS) (GMO ad hoc) Subcommittee Notes

Tuesday, January 10, 2023 1:00 pm ET

Present: Wood Turner (WT), Chair; Logan Petrey (LP), Vice Chair; Brian Caldwell (BC); Carolyn Dimitri (CD); Mindee Jeffery (MJ); Dilip Nandwani (DN)

Absent: None

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC)

Agenda

- Review December 13, 2022 notes
- Research Priorities (WT/All)
- TR template updates (BC/MJ)
- Excluded Methods (MJ/DN/LP)
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **December 13, 2022 notes** were approved with a minor modification to one of the agenda items that was deferred to a later call.
- **Research Priorities (WT/All).** Subcommittees are working on their respective research priorities lists and will send to the MS next month.
- **TR template updates (BC/MJ).** The MS discussed the draft TR templates and the addition of questions regarding excluded methods. MJ requested the original templates to include in the document as appendices, because the redlined versions are cluttered with edits and are getting hard to read. The lead mentioned ideas for how to present the document for public comment, and will include appendices. The group discussed the content of the TR templates and what to include. Members will co-edit the document prior to the weekend so the lead can include suggestions.
- **Excluded Methods (MJ/DN/LP).** The lead would like to use the open docket to seek feedback on the to-be-determined (TBD) list but are not planning to have a discussion document for the Spring meeting. The MS will request a TR for induced mutagenesis to move this forward, despite the ongoing work to update the TR templates. Members will let stakeholders know that the document will be available for review, and the NOP will research ways it may be able to also advertise availability. The lead author is seeking a member to lead the piece on the TBD list.
- **Additional Items.** Members discussed other issues around excluded methods, including fermentation.
- **The meeting was adjourned**

[Previous MS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (2nd Tuesday 1:00 PM ET | 10:00 AM PT, except where noted)

December 13, 2022

TR template updates (BC)

Excluded Methods (DN/LP/MJ)

Jan 10, 2023

Research Priorities (WT/All)

TR template updates (BC/MJ)

Excluded Methods (MJ/DN/LP)

Feb 14, 2023

Research Priorities (WT/All)
 TR template updates (BC/MJ)
 Excluded Methods (MJ/DN/LP)

Mar 14, 2023
 April 11, 2023
 May 9, 2023
 June 13, 2023
 July 11, 2023
 August 8, 2023
 September 12, 2023d
 October 10, 2023
 November 14, 2023
 December 12, 2023

Work Agenda

*Highlight indicates discussion. *Highlight indicates action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

Projects

Project	National List	Contact	Doc Type	Notes	Scheduled / status	Target meeting
Research Priorities (RP)	N/A	WT	Discussion Document (Spr 2023) Proposal (Fall 2023)	May 2012 Framework Proposal <u>Subcommittee reps to MS:</u> Handling (HS): WT Crops (CS): BC Livestock (LS): BC RPs due to MS from HS, CS, and LS by 1.20.23	12.13.22 1.10.23 2.14.23	Spr 2023
Petition and Technical Report (TR) tracking: Update to TR template	N/A	BC/M J/NO P	NA	Ongoing	11.08.22 12.13.22 1.10.23 2.14.23	N/A
Excluded Methods	N/A	MJ/D N/LP	Proposal	MS requested TR on induced mutagenesis 1.10.23.	11.08.22 12.13.22 1.10.23 2.14.23	Spr 2023

Tall oil, distilled	205.601 205.603	WT	HOLD	2008 Petition (distilled tall oil). 2010 TR (tall oil). Petition sent to MS 9.4.20. Petition suff/TR request due 12.8.20. Petition found sufficient 12.8.20, and the MS requested a TR. TR due mid-Aug. TR sent to MS 8.13.21. TR suff due 10.12.21. TR found sufficient 10.12.21. Additional information from petitioner sent to MS 2.8.22 (see "AMS-NOP-21-0087-0003"). Returned to Subcomm at Spr 2022 meeting. On hold pending results from ANPR/guidance.	TBD	TBD
---------------------	--------------------	----	------	--	-----	-----

Milestones

Spring 2023 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~Nov 10, 2022	
NOSB - Spring 2023 proposals due to NOP	Feb 14, 2023	10 weeks
New NOSB member training	TBD	
NOP - Draft Spring 2023 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 3, 2023	
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 6, 2023	7.5
Public comment closes	Apr 5, 2023	3.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 7, 2023	3
Public comment webinars	Apr 18 & 20, 2023	1 week
Spring 2023 NOSB meeting - Atlanta, GA	Apr 25 - 27, 2023	
Final recommendations due	May 25, 2023	